

FINAL STUDY REPORT East Texas Plant Materials Center Nacogdoches, TX

Adaptation Demonstration of Commercial Wildflower Mixes for Creating Pollinator Habitat in East Texas

Alan Shadow and Melinda Brakie

ABSTRACT

The 2008 Farm Bill placed special emphasis on pollinators due to decreasing habitat and colony collapse disorder of honey bees. Desirable pollinator habitat consists of a mix of flowering plants for food and cover for pollinators. The USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center planted and evaluated nine commercially available wildflower mixes from five seed sources in non-replicated demonstration plots near Nacogdoches, TX. Plots were planted February 2011 and evaluated for species present, and those persisting after three years. Seven of the nine plots had 75% or greater ground cover after three years. At the end of three years, most plots were dominated by four species, blanket flower (Gaillardia spp.), lemon mint



Wildflower demonstration stop during the 2011 ETPMC field day, note the concentration of California poppy

(*Monarda citridora*), black eyed-Susan (*Rudbeckia hirta*), and Mexican hat (*Ratibida columnifera*).

INTRODUCTION

Pollinating insects are critical to the production of a vast array of the world's fruit and vegetable production. These crops provide the majority of the vitamins and minerals needed to sustain a healthy life. In 2003 it was estimated that in the United States alone, pollinating insects were responsible for \$18 to \$27 billion in revenue from agricultural crops (Mader et al. 2011). In the last two decades scientists have noticed an alarming trend in the decreasing number of pollinating insect numbers and species (Buchmann and Nabhan 1996; Allen-Wardell et al. 1998; Kearns et al. 1998; Cox and Elmqvist 2000; Steffan-Dewenter et al. 2005; Biesmeijer et al. 2006). The declines have been attributed to man-made causes such as destruction of habitat

through urbanization (Cane 2001), modern agricultural practices (Westrich 1989) and the use of broad spectrum insecticides (Johansen and Mayer 1990).

The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) responded to pollinator decline in the Food, Energy, and Conservation Act of 2008, also known as the Farm Bill, by offering special incentive programs to landowners that developed enhanced pollinator habitat through the Environmental Quality Improvement Program (EQIP). In response to the 2008 Farm Bill and EQIP incentive program the USDA Natural Resources Conservation Service (NRCS) Plant Materials Program set out to develop technical information to assist NRCS field office staff and landowners in developing high quality, diverse habitat for pollinating insects. In support of this effort, the East Texas Plant Materials Center (ETPMC) in Nacogdoches, TX set up demonstration plots to evaluate commercially available wildflower mixes from seed companies. The mixes were mostly comprised of native wildflower species that were adapted to east Texas and surrounding areas. The demonstration plots were maintained for three years to monitor the species that were present after planting relative to the species in the mix and the species that persisted over the three year study.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Nine commercial wildflower mixes were purchased from five seed sources and planted in non-replicated demonstration plots at the ETPMC from 2011-2013 (Table 1). The 40-ft x 80-ft plots were planted on 11 February 2011 into a clean, firm, prepared seed bed using a Hege 1000 research plot drill (Wintersteiger Salt Lake City, UT). The seedbed was prepared by disking the plot area in two directions in mid- January, culti-packing, and treating with glyphosate before planting to eliminate any weeds that had germinated. The February planting date was chosen to allow ample time for seed to stratify in cool soil to



Planting wildflower mixes into a clean, prepared seedbed using a Hege 1000 research plot planter

maximize germination when warmer temperatures arrived. Seeding specifications were adjusted for each plot based on recommendations provided by the seed companies. Plots were irrigated as needed for establishment during the first year using overhead sprinklers. Poast Plus[®] and Select Max[®] were applied at 1.5 pints/acre, and 12 oz. /acre, respectively to control competition from annual, warm season, grasses. One hundred pounds of 13-13-13 was applied to each plot in March 2012 and 2013 to stimulate growth and flowering. Plots were mowed annually in the fall after the majority of plants had mature seed. Alley ways between plots were maintained using a rotary tiller to prevent plots growing into one another. Species present in each plot were recorded during the first growing season and in year three to denote plants that emerged after planting and the plants that persisted in the plots. Plots were mowed in October 2013 to remove standing biomass. Percent cover was measured by randomly placing a 1 m² grid consisting of 25 cells in the plot at 4 locations and counting the number of cells within the grid that were occupied by a wildflower rosette. Percent cover was not measured during the first year due to

the spacing of the planter's drilled rows, 8 inches between rows. Seed was not randomly distributed and an accurate measure would not have been obtained due to the size of the cells within the grid.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

There was a complete stand after planting except the Turner Starburst Fall Mix and Turner Texas Native Fall Mix plots (Table 1). These were the only fall mixes in the demonstration and were not planted at the optimum time for the plant species in the mixes. Plants remained weak throughout the three years producing 50 and 85 percent cover at year three. It should be noted that the demonstration was managed uniformly across seed mixes and the fall mix plots were mowed during the fall with the warm season mix plots. It is anticipated this operation resulted in low flower production, leading to less seed available for reseeding as was noted in the warm season plots. Native American Seed's Butterfly Retreat Mix and Bamert's American Magic Wildflower Mix produced 75 and 65 percent cover at year three, while the remaining mixes produced 85% cover or greater (Table 1).

Specie occurrence within a commercial mix was reported in 2011 and again in 2013 as an estimate of persistence over three years (Table 2a-2i). Species within a mix without asterisks were not present at either evaluation dates. Seed may have germinated and never emerged or emerged and the seedlings died or seed never initiated germination. There is no definitive reason for their lack of occurrence in the planted plots. Species persistence after 2011 may be attributed to lack of adaptability to growing conditions in east Texas, growth habit (e.g. annual, biannual), wildlife



Complete stand of seedlings seen behind and adjacent to one of the fall mix plots that did not yield a complete stand after a spring planting



Close up view of a plot after planting showing typical stand and 8 inch spacing of a warm season seed mix during establishment of the demonstration.

damage, or soil disturbance to encourage reseeding. Plots containing California poppy, *Eschscholzia californica*, in the seed mixes were dominated by this species in the first year, but its presence steadily decreased over time, and was only a minor component of the species present by year three. California poppy is shown to be found in Tarrant and Ellis Counties in Texas and Bossier and Lincoln Parishes in Louisiana (USDA NRCS 2014), though it was probably introduced to these areas by seed sources from commercial or residential plantings. It produced rapid establishment during the first year, and was one of the earliest blooming species in the demonstration plots. It has excellent potential as a pioneer species that provides an early nectar source and cover while perennial wildflowers establish. California poppy does not appear to be invasive in its growth or re-seeding habits in east Texas.

Four wildflower species dominated the plots at the end of year three. *Gaillardia* spp. (blanket flower), *Monardo citridora*. (lemon mint), *Rudbeckia hirta*, (black-eyed Susan), and *Ratibida columnifera* (Mexican hat). These species were present in every plot by year three; whether they were part of the original seed mix or not. Their competitive nature and prolific seed production might be compensated by reducing their overall percentage in the seed mixes and increasing the seed percentage of species with wildlife value such as *Desmanthus illinoensis*, *Desmodium* spp, *Dalea* spp., *Helianthus* spp., and *Chamaecrista fasciculata*

Multiple species of butterflies, moths, bees,

triticale, radish, turnip, and kale to access the wildflower plots.



There were multiple *Gaillardia* species in the seed mixes that dominated the plots the third year after planting.

wasps, flies, and beetles were observed in the plots. General observations found ruby-throated hummingbirds (*Archilochus colubris*) utilizing some flower species as nectar sources, and morning doves (*Zenaida macroura*) and song birds utilized alley ways and mowed plots to forage for seed in late summer through mid-winter. White-tailed deer (*Odocoileus virginianus*) utilized the plots heavily in late winter and early spring, feeding on wildflower rosettes. Selective browsing may have contributed to the proliferation of less palatable species such as blanket flower, lemon mint, Mexican hat, and black-eyed Susan. It was noted in December 2012 that white-tailed deer created trails through cover crop fields planted to a mix of oats, wheat,

CONCLUSION

The use of commercially available wildflower seed mixes to rapidly develop pollinator habitat in east Texas is a feasible option for landowners. There are commercial wildflower mixes available from multiple sources, and most have specialty blends for specific geographic regions or desired pollinators. Adding wildflower mixes to native grass plantings will increase the diversity of the planting and increase wildlife use, both vertebrate and invertebrate. Properly managed plantings will last multiple years with adequate species diversity, though additional plantings or soil disturbance may be needed on 3 to 5 year intervals to increase species occurrence or maximize species diversity. Additional wildlife benefits for birds, small mammals, and deer may be obtained by focusing on palatable wildflower species, especially legumes, and those that produce seed utilized by wildlife.

LITERATURE CITED

Allen-Wardell G., Bernhardt P., Bitner R., Burques A., Buchmann S., Cane J., Cox P.A., Dalton V., Feinsinger P., Ingram M., Inouye D., Jones C.E., Kenndedy K., Kevan P.G., Koopowitz H., Medellin R., Medellin-Morales S., Nabhan G.P., Pavlik B., Tepedino V., Torchio P., Walker S., (1998) The potential consequences of pollinator declines on the conservation of biodiversity and the stability of the food crop yields. Conserv Biol 12:8-17.

- Biesmeijer J.C., Roberts S.P., Reemer M., Ohlemuller R., Edwards M., Peeters T., Schaffer A., Potts S.G., Kleukers R., Thomas C.D., Settele J., Kunin W.E. (2006) Parallel declines in pollinators and insect-pollinated plants in Britain and the Netherlands. Science 313:351-354.
- Buchmann S.L., Nabhan G.P. 1996. The forgotten pollinators. Island Press, Washington, D.C.
- Cane, J.H. 2001. Habitat fragmentation and native bees: a premature verdict? Conservation Ecology5(1):3 [online] URL: <u>http://www.consecol.org/vol5/iss1/art3</u>.
- Cox, P.A., Elmqvist T. 2000. Pollinator extinction on the Pacific Islands. Conserv Biol 14:1237-1239.
- Johansen, C.A., and D.F. Mayer. 1990. Pollinator protection: a bee and pesticide handbook. Wicwas Press, Cheshire, Connecticut, USA.
- Kearns, C.A., Inouye D.W., Waser N.M. 1998. Endangered mutualisms: the conservation of plantpollinator interactions. Annu Rev Ecol Syst 29:83-112.
- Mader, E., Shepherd M., Vaughn, M., Black, S.H., and LeBuhn, G. 2011. Attracting native pollinators. Storey Publishing. North Adams, MA.
- Steffan-Dewenter I., Potts, S.G., Packer, L. 2005. Pollinator diversity and crop pollination services are at risk. Trends Ecol Evol 20:651-652.
- USDA, NRCS. 2014. The PLANTS Database (http://plants.usda.gov, 7 July 2014). National Plant Data Team, Greensboro, NC 27401-4901 USA
- Westrich, P. 1989. Die Wildbienen Baden-Wurttembergs. Allgemeiner Teil: Lebensraume, Verhalten, Okologie und Schultz. Verlag Eugen Ulmer, Stuttgart, Germany.

Mention of a seed company name does not indicate endorsement by NRCS, nor does NRCS guarantee availability or quantity of seeds produced by the seed company.

Helping People Help the Land USDA IS AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY PROVIDER AND EMPLOYER

Seed Source	Mix	Planting Rate	Percent Cover
		lb/acre	3 rd Year
Native American Seed	Butterfly Retreat	20	75
Bamert	Bird and Butterfly Blend	8	100
Bamert	American Magic Wildflower Miz	x 8	65
Turner Seed	Starburst Spring Mix	10	100
Turner Seed	Starburst Fall Mix	10	85
Turner Seed	Texas Native Spring Mix	10	100
Turner Seed	Texas Native Fall Mix	10	50
Douglass King Co.	King's Wildflower Mix	30	100
Applewood Seed Co	Texas/Oklahoma Wildflower Mi	x 12	85

Table 1. Wildflower demonstration seed sources and planting rates, USDA-NRCS EastTexas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX 2014.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Texas Bluebonnet	Lupinus subcarnosus	
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Lanceleaf Coreopsis	Coreopsis lanceolata	**
American Basketflower	Centaurea americana	*
Purple Coneflower	Echinacea purpurea	
Golden-Wave	Coreopsis basilis	**
Greenthread	Thelesperma filifolium	
Purple Prairie Clover	Dalea purpurea	
Cutleaf Daisy	Erigeron compositus	**
Partridge Pea	Chamaecrista fasciculata	**
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Illinois Bundleflower	Desmanthus illinoensis	*
Drummond Phlox	Phlox drummondii	**
Tahoka Daisy	Machaeranthera tanacetifolia	
Prairie Verbena	Glandularia bipinnatifida	*
Standing Cypress	Ipomopsis rubra	**
Maximilian Sunflower	Helianthus maximiliani	**
Gayfeather	Liatris punctata	
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Scarlet Sage	Salvia coccinea	*
Mealy Blue Sage	Salvia farinacea	
Butterfly Weed	Asclepias tuberosa	
Winecup	Callirhoe digitata	**
Foxglove	Penstemon cobaea	

Table 2a. Wildflower species present in "Native American Seed CompanyButterfly Retreat Mix" in year one and after year three. USDA-NRCS EastTexas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

* species present in 2011

** species present in 2013

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Baby's Breath	Gypsophila muralis	*
Texas Bluebonnet	Lupinus subcarnosus	**
Purple Coneflower	Echinacea purpurea	
Lance Leaved Coreopsis	Coreopsis lanceolata	**
Sulphur Cosmos	Cosmos sulphureus	
Annual Gaillardia	Gaillardia sp.	**
Annual Candytuft	<i>Iberis</i> sp.	
Corn Poppy	Papaver rhoeas	*
Red Phlox	Phlox paniculata	**
Purple Prairie Clover	Dalea purpurea	
Dwarf Blue Cornflower	Centaurea cyanus	*
'Polka Dot Mix' Cornflower	Centaurea cyanus	*
Golden Wave Tickseed	Coreopsis basalis	**
Dotted Gayfeather	Liatris punctata	
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Dwarf Evening Primrose	Oenothera sp.	**
Clasping Coneflower	Dracopis amplexicaulis	
Prairie Coneflower	Ratibida columnifera	**
Scarlet Sage	Salvia coccinea	
Greenthread	Thelesperma filifolium	*
Black-eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Showy Evening Primrose	Oenothera speciosa	*

 Table 2b. Wildflower species present in "Applewood Seed Company
Texas/Oklahoma Mix" in year one and after year three. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

Table 2c. Wildflower species present in "Douglas King Seed Company King's *Wildflower Mix*" in year one and after year three. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Clasping Coneflower	Dracopis amplexicaulis	
Showy Evening Primrose	Oenothera speciosa	*
Verbena	<i>Verbena</i> sp.	**
Drummond Phlox	Phlox drummondii	**
Blue Bonnet	Lupinus subcarnosus	**
Mexican Hat	Ratibida columnifera	**
Plains Coreopsis	Coreopsis tinctoria	**
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Greenthread	Thelesperma filifolium	*

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Bachelor Button	Centaurea cyanus	**
California Poppy	Eschscholzia californica	*
Blue Flax	Linum perenne	*
Annual Lupine	Lupinus concinnus	
Baby's Breath	Gypsophila muralis	*
Lance Leaved Coreopsis	Coreopsis lanceolata	**
Sensation Mix Cosmos	Cosmos bipinnatus	*
Chinese Forget-Me-Not	Cynoglossum amabile	
Sweet Alyssum	Lobularia maritima	
Scarlet Flax	Linum grandiflorum	*
Sweet William	Phlox divaricata	*
Bearded Dianthus	Dianthus sp.	
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Godetia	Clarkia amoena	*
Annual Mallow	Lavatera trimestris	*
Purple Coneflower	Echinacea purpurea	
Plains Coreopsis	Coreopsis tinctoria	*
Rocket Larkspur	Consolida ajacis	**
African Daisy	Castalis tragus	
Corn Poppy	Papaver rhoeas	*
Yellow Prairie Coneflower	Ratibida columnifera	**
Money Plant	Lunaria annua	
Clarkia	<i>Clarkia</i> sp.	*
Shasta Daisy	Leucanthemum maximum	
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Columbine	Aquilegia sp.	
White Yarrow	Achillea millefolium	*
Strawflower	Bracteantha bracteata	*
Gayfeather	Liatris sp.	

Table 2d. Wildflower species present in "Bamert Seed Company AmericanMagic Wildflower Mix" in 2011 and 2013. USDA-NRCS East Texas PlantMaterials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

* species present in 2011

** species present in 2013

 Table 2e. Wildflower species present in "Bamert Seed Company Bird and
Butterfly Blend Mix" in 2011 and 2013. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Perennial Lupine	Lupinus perennis	
Siberian Wallflower	Erysimum x marshallii	
California Poppy	Eschscholzia californica	*
Annual Candytuft	<i>Iberis</i> sp.	
Rocket Larkspur	Consolida ajacis	*
Purple Coneflower	Echinacea purpurea	
Perennial Gaillardia	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Black-eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Annual Gaillardia	<i>Gaillardia</i> sp.	**
Blue Flax	Linum perenne	*
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Lance Leaved Coreopsis	Coreopsis lanceolata	**
Showy Milkweed	Asclepias speciosa	
Dwarf Godetia	Clarkia amoena	*
Dwarf Coneflower	<i>Echinacea</i> sp.	
Dwarf Plains Coreopsis	Coreopsis tinctoria	*
Sweet Alyssum	Lobularia maritima	
Scarlet Flax	Linum grandiflorum	
Gayfeather	Liatris sp.	
Dwarf Red Coneflower	Ratibida columnifera	**

 Table 2f. Wildflower species present in "Turner Seed Company Starburst Fall
Mix" in 2011 and 2013. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Black Sampson	Echinacea angustifolia	
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Blue Flax	Linum lewisii	**
Blue Bonnet	Lupinus sp.	
California Poppy	Eschscholzia californica	*
Corn Poppy (red)	Papaver rhoeas	*
Drummond Phlox	Phlox drummondii	**
Huisache Daisy	Amblyolepis setigera	*
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Pitchers Sage	Salvia azurea	
Plains Coreopsis	Coreopsis tinctoria	**
Purple Coneflower	Echinacea purpurea	
Purple Prairie Clover	Dalea purpurea	
Scarlet Flax	Linum grandiflorum	
Showey Evening Primrose	Oenothera speciosa	*
White Yarrow	Achillea millefolium	*

Table 2g. Wildflower species present in "Turner Seed Co. Starburst Spring
Mix" in 2011 and 2013. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center,
Nacogdoches, TX.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Bachelor Button	Centaurea cyanus	**
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Blue Flax	Linum lewisii	*
Butterfly Milkweed	Asclepias tuberosa	
California Poppy	Eschscholzia californica	**
Corn Poppy	Papaver rhoeas	*
Cosmos	Cosmos sp.	*
Drummond Phlox	Phlox drummondii	**
Gayfeather	Liatris sp.	
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Lance Leaf Coreopsis	Coreopsis lanceolata	**
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Moss Verbena	Glandularia pulchella	
Purple Coneflower	Echinacea purpurea	
Purple Prairie Clover	Dalea purpurea	
Scarlet Flax	Linum grandiflorum	
Scarlet Sage	Salvia coccinea	
White Yarrow	Achillea millefolium	*

Table 2h. Wildflower species present in "Turner Seed Co. Native Spring Mix" in 2011 and 2013. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Black Samson	Echinacea angustifolia	
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Clasping Coneflower	Dracopis amplexicaulis	
Gayfeather	Liatris sp.	
Huisache Daisy	Amblyolepis setigera	**
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Lead Plant	Amorpha canescens	
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Mexican Hat	Ratibida columnifera	**
Plains Coreopsis	Coreopsis tinctoria	**
Prairie Verbena	Glandularia bipinnatifida	*
Cuero' Purple Prairie Clover	Dalea purpurea	
Sleepy Daisy	Xanthisma texanum	
Standing Cypress	Ipomopsis rubra	
Tahoka Daisy	Machaeranthera tanacetifolia	
White Prickley Poppy	Argemone albiflora	**

Table 2i. Wildflower species present in "Turner Seed Co. Native Fall Mix" in 2011 and 2013. USDA-NRCS East Texas Plant Materials Center, Nacogdoches, TX.

Common Name	Scientific Name	Presence
Black Sampson	Echinacea angustifolia	
Black-Eyed Susan	Rudbeckia hirta	**
Blue Bonnets	Lupinus sp.	
Clasping Coneflower	Dracopis amplexicaulis	
Cutleaf Primrose	Oenothera laciniata	**
Gayfeather	Liatris sp.	
Greenthread	Thelesperma filifolium	*
Huisache Daisy	Amblyolepis setigera	
Indian Blanket	Gaillardia pulchella	**
Lemon Mint	Monarda citridora	**
Mexican Hat	Ratibida columnifera	**
Pitcher Sage	Salvia azurea	
Plains Coreopsis	Coreopsis tinctoria	**
Purple Prairie Clover	Dalea purpurea	
Showy Evening Primrose	Oenothera speciosa	*
Sleepy Daisy	Xanthisma texanum	*
White Prickly Poppy	Argemone albiflora	**
* species present in 2011	·	
** species present in 2013		